

REPUBLIC OF KENYA

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KENYA AT KAKAMEGA

MISCELLANEOUS CRIMINAL APPLICATION NO. 35B OF 2019

WILLIAM OKUNGU RITINYA.....1ST APPLICANT

ROBERT OWINO OWITI.....2ND APPLICANT

JOHN OSIENO OYAGI.....3RD APPLICANT

BRIAN NYAMETHO NYANDIEKA.....4TH APPLICANT

VERSUS

REPUBLIC.....RESPONDENT

RULING

1. This matter was placed before me for the purpose of giving directions, in view of the recent decision by the Supreme Court in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic; Katiba Institute & 5 others (Amicus Curiae)* [2021] (Koome CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ibrahim, Wanjala, Ndung'u & Lenaola SSJJ), with respect to mandatory sentences, where it was clarified that the decision, in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic* [2017] eKLR (Maraga CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ojwang, Wanjala, Njoki and Lenaola SCJJ), had arisen from proceedings relating to murder, under section 204 of the Penal Code, Cap 63, Laws of Kenya, and the position stated in the said decision was intended to apply only to mandatory sentences with respect to murder cases.

2. The application herein, the Motion dated 24th May 2019 and amended on 10th June 2019, principally rides on the decision, in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic* [2017] eKLR (Maraga CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ojwang, Wanjala, Njoki and Lenaola SCJJ), for the applicants seek review of their sentences, following their convictions for robbery with violence, under section 296(2) of the Penal Code, in Kisumu CMCCRC No. 181 of 2004. They lodged appeals at the High Court and Court of Appeal at Kisumu, which were dismissed. Ideally, this matter should have been placed before the High Court at Kisumu.

3. Anyhow, the offence, the subject of the instant proceedings, is not murder, but robbery with violence, as defined in section 296(2) of the Penal Code, the decision in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic* [2017] eKLR (Maraga CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ojwang, Wanjala, Njoki and Lenaola SCJJ), therefore, does not apply to it. As a consequence, the High Court has no jurisdiction to review the sentence that was imposed by the trial court, based on the decision in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic; Katiba Institute & 5 others (Amicus Curiae)* [2021] (Koome CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ibrahim, Wanjala, Ndung'u & Lenaola SSJJ). Since there is no jurisdiction on my part to entertain the application, I shall strike it out, for it is incompetent. The said file shall be closed.

4. The Deputy Registrar shall cause copies of this ruling to be availed to the applicant and the office of Director of Public Prosecutions, Kakamega.

PREPARED, DATED AND SIGNED AT KAKAMEGA THIS 12TH DAY OF NOVEMBER 2021

W MUSYOKA

JUDGE