



**REPUBLIC OF KENYA**

**IN THE HIGH COURT OF KENYA**

**AT KAKAMEGA**

**CRIMINAL PETITION NO. 39 OF 2019**

**BONFACE AGOMBA Alias NANDWA CHENELWA.....PETITIONER**

**VERSUS**

**REPUBLIC.....RESPONDENT**

**RULING**

1. This matter was placed before me for the purpose of giving directions, in view of the recent decision by the Supreme Court in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic; Katiba Institute & 5 others (Amicus Curiae [2021])* (Koome CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ibrahim, Wanjala, Ndung'u & Lenaola SSJJ), with respect to mandatory sentences, where it was clarified that the decision, in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic [2017]* eKLR (Maraga CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ojwang, Wanjala, Njoki and Lenaola SCJJ), had arisen from proceedings relating to murder, under section 204 of the Penal Code, Cap 63, Laws of Kenya, and the position stated in the said decision was intended to apply only to mandatory sentences with respect to murder cases.

2. The petition herein, undated, but filed herein on 1<sup>st</sup> April 2019, principally rides on the decision, in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic [2017]* eKLR (Maraga CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ojwang, Wanjala, Njoki and Lenaola SCJJ), for the petitioner seeks review of his sentence, where he had been convicted of robbery with violence, under section 296(2) of the Penal Code, in Kakamega CMCCRC No. 646 of 2005, and was sentenced to death. He filed appeals in Kakamega HCCRA No. 60 of 2009 and Kisumu CACRA No. 187 of 2012, both of which were dismissed by the appellate court.

3. The offence, the subject of the instant proceedings, is not murder, but robbery with violence, as defined in section 296(2) of the Penal Code, the decision in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic [2017]* eKLR (Maraga CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ojwang, Wanjala, Njoki and Lenaola SCJJ), therefore, does not apply to it. As a consequence, the High Court has no jurisdiction to review the sentence that was imposed by the trial court, based on the decision in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic; Katiba Institute & 5 others (Amicus Curiae [2021])* (Koome CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ibrahim, Wanjala, Ndung'u & Lenaola SSJJ). Since there is no jurisdiction on my part to entertain the petition, I shall strike it out, for it is incompetent. The said file shall be closed.

4. The Deputy Registrar to cause copies of this ruling to be availed to the petitioner and the office of the Director of Public Prosecutions.

**PREPARED, DATED AND SIGNED AT KAKAMEGA THIS 12<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF NOVEMBER, 2021**

**W MUSYOKA**

**JUDGE**