

REPUBLIC OF KENYA

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KENYA

AT KAKAMEGA

CRIMINAL APPLICATION NO. 21 OF 2018

PAUL NDETA.....APPLICANT

VERSUS

REPUBLIC.....RESPONDENT

RULING

1. This matter was placed before me for the purpose of giving directions, in view of the recent decision by the Supreme Court in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic; Katiba Institute & 5 others (Amicus Curiae* [2021] (Koome CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ibrahim, Wanjala, Ndung'u & Lenaola SSJJ), with respect to mandatory sentences, where it was clarified that the decision, in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic* [2017] eKLR (Maraga CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ojwang, Wanjala, Njoki and Lenaola SCJJ), had arisen from proceedings relating to murder, under section 204 of the Penal Code, Cap 63, Laws of Kenya, and the position stated in the said decision was intended to apply only to mandatory sentences with respect to murder cases.

2. The Motion herein, dated 16th April 2018, was filed herein on 12th April 2018, and is principally founded on the decision, in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic* [2017] eKLR (Maraga CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ojwang, Wanjala, Njoki and Lenaola SCJJ), for the applicant seeks review of his sentence, where he had been convicted of robbery with violence, contrary to section 296(2) of the Penal Code, in Butali SRMCRCRC No. 123 of 2008, and was sentenced to death. He filed appeals in Kakamega HCCRA No. 74 of 2010 and Kisumu CACRA No. 64 of 2014, which were both dismissed. The death penalty was later commuted to life imprisonment by the President of the Republic of Kenya.

3. The offence, the subject of the instant proceedings, is not murder, but robbery with violence, as defined in Section 296(2) of the Penal Code, the decision in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic* [2017] eKLR (Maraga CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ojwang, Wanjala, Njoki and Lenaola SCJJ), therefore, does not apply to it. As a consequence, the High Court has no jurisdiction to review the sentence that was imposed by the trial court, in view of the directions given in *Francis Karioko Muruatetu & another vs. Republic; Katiba Institute & 5 others (Amicus Curiae* [2021] (Koome CJ&P, Mwilu DCJ&VP, Ibrahim, Wanjala, Ndung'u & Lenaola SSJJ). The application and petition are incompetent.

4. The Deputy Registrar shall cause copies of this ruling to be availed to the petitioner and the office of Director of Public Prosecutions, Kakamega.

PREPARED, DATED AND SIGNED AT KAKAMEGA THIS 14TH DAY OF JANUARY 2022

W MUSYOKA

JUDGE